

This Final Report is the culmination of the efforts of the York University Constitutional Project, a project of the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy. The Report is based on a comprehensive eight-month study by researchers at the Centre, meetings and conferences with eighteen distinguished academics from York University and the University of Toronto, and individual Background Studies by distinguished academics and professionals throughout Canada.

The Report puts forward and discusses forty-eight recommendations on legal issues surrounding Québec sovereignty, Ontario's interests in the current constitutional discussions, and the federal proposals released in September of 1991. The Report is written in a manner which promotes discussion and cooperation on specific issues, with the objective of arriving at a consensus. By so doing, it brings us one step closer to a resolution of Canada's constitutional problems.

Patrick Monahan is Director of the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy and an Associate Professor, Osgoode Hall Law School of York University. Lynda Covello is Director of Research, York University Constitutional Reform Project, York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy.

AN AGENDA FOR CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM

Patrick Monahan and Lynda Covello

FINAL REPORT
OF THE YORK UNIVERSITY CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM PROJECT





CENTRE FOR
PUBLIC LAW
AND PUBLIC
POLICY

Established in 1986 at Osgoode Hall Law School, the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy is dedicated to the study and public discussion of the role of law in the formation and expression of public policy and its impact on society. The Centre's focus is on current and emerging issues of public policy, with an emphasis on constitutional issues, the role of institutions, and the legal aspects of the public policy process. In addition to its own research, the Centre sponsors research by others, hosts conferences and seminars, and publishes an assortment of papers and reports.

Inquiries about the Centre's projects and publications should be directed to the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, Osgoode Hall Law School, 4700 Keele Street, North York, Ontario, M3J 1P3. Tel: (416) 736-5515

THE YORK UNIVERSITY
CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM PROJECT

This publication is part of the Centre's latest project, the York University Constitutional Reform Project. The Project studied the legal issues surrounding Québec sovereignty, Ontario's interests in the current constitutional discussions, and the federal proposals released in September of 1991. A comprehensive eight-month study by researchers at the Centre, meetings and conferences with eighteen distinguished academics from York University and the University of Toronto, and individual studies by distinguished academics and professionals throughout Canada culminated in the publication of eleven Background Studies and a Final Report. The Final Report, *An Agenda For Constitutional Reform*, is written by Patrick Monahan, Director of the Centre, and Lynda Covello, Coordinator and Director of Research for the Project. The Report puts forward and discusses forty-eight recommendations on constitutional reform. The publications are listed on the inside of the back cover.

AN AGENDA
FOR
CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM

Patrick Monahan and Lynda Covello

FINAL REPORT
OF THE YORK UNIVERSITY CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM PROJECT

York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy
North York, Ontario
1992

York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy
Osgoode Hall Law School
4700 Keele Street
North York, Ontario
M3J 1P3
Phone: (416) 736 5515

An Agenda for Constitutional Reform
Patrick Monahan and Lynda Covello

Final Report of the York University Constitutional Reform Project

This Final Report was published simultaneously with the eleven
Background Studies of the Project. The inside of the back cover
lists the publications, and explains how to order them.

ISBN 1-895274-11-7

© Patrick Monahan and Lynda Covello, 1992

Copy-edited by Craig J. Penney
Designed and typeset by S. Joseph Grmovsek and Craig J. Penney
Cover design by Rossitza Skortcheva Penney
Printed by Becker Associates, Concord, Ontario

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

PATRICK J. MONAHAN is the Director of the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy, and an Associate Professor at Osgoode Hall Law School of York University. He is the author of *Meech Lake: The Inside Story* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1991) and *Politics and the Constitution* (Toronto: Carswell Press, 1987), as well as many articles in this subject area. He served as Senior Constitutional Advisor to the Premier of Ontario from March 1989 to September 1990, and as Senior Policy Advisor to the Attorney General of Ontario from July 1986 to March 1989.

LYNDA P. COVELLO is the Director of Research and Project Coordinator of the York University Constitutional Reform Project at the York University Centre for Public Law and Public Policy. She is also currently completing work on her LL. M. thesis in the area of legal theory at Osgoode Hall Law School of York University. Prior to that, she was an associate lawyer with the firm of Blake, Cassels & Graydon in Toronto. She was also a law clerk to the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court of Ontario.

Summary Of Contents

Preface	xi
PART I: AN OVERVIEW	1
PART II: SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	11
PART III: THE CURRENT ROUND	23
PART IV: THE PROCESS OF CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM	81
PART V: ISSUES RELATING TO QUEBEC SOVEREIGNTY	89
APPENDIX I: LIST OF TEAM MEMBERS	121
APPENDIX II: SUMMARY OF THE ELEVEN BACKGROUND STUDIES	123
APPENDIX III: ROUND-TABLE MEETING HELD ON 9 MAY 1991	135
APPENDIX IV: ROUND-TABLE MEETING HELD ON 7 JUNE 1991	149

Contents

Preface	xi
PART I: AN OVERVIEW	1
A. <i>Our Contribution</i>	1
B. <i>The Key Issues</i>	2
C. <i>Ontario's Response</i>	4
D. <i>The Proposals of the Federal Government</i>	5
E. <i>The Process of Reform</i>	7
F. <i>Canada Without Québec</i>	8
G. <i>The Task Before Us</i>	9
PART II: SUMMARY OF RECOMMENDATIONS	11
PART III: THE CURRENT ROUND	23
A. <i>Introduction</i>	23
B. <i>Québec's Distinctiveness and the Canadian Federation</i>	24
1. <i>The Federal Proposals</i>	29
(a) <i>Recognition of Québec's distinctiveness and Canada's linguistic duality</i>	30
(b) <i>Legislative delegation</i>	31
(c) <i>Labour-market training</i>	33
(d) <i>Immigration</i>	34
(e) <i>Culture</i>	35
(f) <i>Federal residual power</i>	36
(g) <i>The declaratory power</i>	37
(h) <i>Recognizing areas of provincial jurisdiction</i>	39
(i) <i>The exercise of the federal spending power in areas of exclusive provincial jurisdiction</i>	41
(j) <i>The amending formula</i>	42
C. <i>Aboriginal Peoples and Constitutional Reform</i>	45
1. <i>Introduction</i>	45
2. <i>History</i>	47
3. <i>The Federal Proposals</i>	51
D. <i>Institutional Reform</i>	55
1. <i>Background</i>	55

2. Senate reform	58	2. The process of constitutional reform	140
(a) <i>Developing an approach</i>	58	3. The constitution and social policy	143
(b) <i>Proposals on the powers of a reformed Senate</i>	62	4. Language policy	145
(c) <i>The selection of Senators</i>	64	5. Aboriginal interests	146
(d) <i>The distribution of Senate seats</i>	65		
3. The Council of the Federation and the economic union	66	APPENDIX IV: ROUND-TABLE MEETING HELD ON 7 JUNE 1991	149
(a) <i>The Council of the Federation</i>	67	A. <i>List of Participants</i>	149
(b) <i>The economic union and the social union</i>	68	B. <i>Agenda of the Meeting</i>	151
(c) <i>The power to manage the economic union</i>	72	C. <i>Synopsis of the Discussion on 7 June 1991</i>	156
(d) <i>An expanded section 121</i>	76	1. Setting the stage	156
E. <i>Other Amendments</i>	79	2. The process of constitutional reform	156
1. Property rights	79	3. Reforming central institutions: Senate reform	159
2. The notwithstanding clause	79	4. The constitution and social policy: the case of Medicare	161
3. A Canada Clause	80	5. Issues relating to Québec sovereignty	163
PART IV: THE PROCESS OF CONSTITUTIONAL REFORM	81		
PART V: ISSUES RELATING TO QUEBEC SOVEREIGNTY	89		
A. <i>The Importance of the Issue</i>	89		
B. <i>The Context of Negotiations Over Sovereignty by Québec</i>	90		
C. <i>The Legal and Political Context of Québec Separation</i>	92		
D. <i>Implications: Québec's Right to Secede From Canada</i>	98		
E. <i>The Process of Negotiating Québec Secession</i>	99		
F. <i>Territorial Issues</i>	100		
G. <i>Responsibility for the Canadian Debt</i>	104		
H. <i>Sovereignty-Association Between Québec and Canada</i>	105		
I. <i>Ontario Within the Rest of Canada</i>	112		
1. Understanding the problem	112		
2. Implications for Ontario	115		
3. Conclusion	118		
APPENDIX I: LIST OF TEAM MEMBERS	121		
A. <i>Project Team Members</i>	121		
B. <i>Secretariat of the York University Constitutional Reform Project</i>	122		
APPENDIX II: SUMMARY OF THE ELEVEN BACKGROUND STUDIES	123		
APPENDIX III: ROUND-TABLE MEETING HELD ON 9 MAY 1991	135		
A. <i>List of Participants</i>	135		
B. <i>Agenda of the Meeting</i>	137		
C. <i>Synopsis of Discussion on 9 May 1991</i>	140		
1. Setting the stage	140		